

Department for International Development Civil Society Challenge Fund

**Advocacy for Effective Implementation of ILO
Convention 182 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour
1 September 2002 – 31 August 2004**

Final Project Evaluation

Report prepared by:

Anti-Slavery International

Defence for Children International (Costa Rica)

Peace Trust (Tamil Nadu)

African Network for Prevention and Protection Against Child Abuse and Neglect
(Kenya)

Society for the Protection of the Rights of the Child (Pakistan)

WAO-Afrique (Togo/Ghana)

22 November 2004

<u>Contents</u>	<u>Page no</u>
I – Introduction	3
II - Reviewing progress against project outputs	5
1. Strengthened civil society networks	5
2. Increased inter-ministry communication, collaboration and coherence on child labour matters	7
3. Ratification of Convention 182 in India, and consolidation of National Plans of Action	9
4. Increased understanding of child labour amongst the public and civil society	10
5. Increased state institutional capacity	11
6. Improved functioning of legislative, administrative and protective processes	13
7. Increased media coverage	14
8. Lessons learned and improvements recommended	16
III - Conclusion and next steps	21
Annex 1 - List of acronyms	23
Annex 2 - Lists of available project-related materials	24
Annex 3 – Text of ILO Convention 182 and Recommendation 190 on Worst Forms of Child Labour	28

I. Introduction

1. The project was coordinated by Anti-Slavery International, and implemented in Costa Rica by Defence for Children International (DNI), by Peace Trust in Tamil Nadu (India), by the African Network for Prevention and Protection against Child Abuse and Neglect (ANPPCAN) in Kenya, by the Society for the Protection of the Rights of the Child (SPARC) in Pakistan, and in Togo and Ghana by WAO-Afrique. Project activities commenced on 1 September 2002 and were completed on 31 March 2004. 1 April – 31 August 2004 was devoted to evaluating the success of the project and writing up the evaluation reports.

2. The ultimate goal of the project was to bring about the effective reduction of the WFCL in the countries represented through appropriate government action and involvement of civil society actors and public to strengthen and implement ILO Convention 182 (C182). This was to be achieved primarily through strengthening and sustaining civil society networks, enabling them to work together on information sharing, awareness-raising and advocacy opportunities to ensure the effective implementation, public understanding and support of C182. Also to build capacity for advocacy work amongst civil society organisations and capacity to implement C182 effectively amongst enforcement agency employees.

3. This project arose out of the partners' joint experience of a DfID funded project 1999-2000 to press for ratification of C182 in the same five countries as well as Brazil. This resulted in C182 ratification in all countries involved apart from India and it was deemed a success. However partners identified the need to continue their work to ensure that C182 was also implemented as laid out in its accompanying Recommendation 190 (R190). Not only do C182 and R190 explicitly call for governments to consult "other concerned groups" as well as trade unions and employers' organisations¹, project partners saw a crucial role for civil society in working to raise awareness and change attitudes at local, provincial and national levels, and in this project in some cases also at the regional level. Moreover, partners wanted to ensure that not only NGOs working on relevant issues, but also families and children who were vulnerable to or directly affected by the WFCL would have the opportunity to contribute their views and experiences to this process.

4. In concrete terms, the project partners sought to achieve their objectives by addressing a number of key areas:

1. **Strengthened civil society networks** with good relations between NGOs, grass roots groups, religious institutions and unions; inclusion of non-traditional civil society partners, namely trade unions and employers; greater understanding of labour rights and ability to work together for same ends.
2. **Increased inter-ministry communication, collaboration and coherence on child labour matters.** This in turn will lead to continued government commitment and understanding on the issue of the worst forms of child labour, which should then devolve down to local government level.
3. **Ratification of Convention 182 in India, and consolidation of National Plans of Action** which reflect the concerns of civil society, employers' and workers' groups, children and their families in countries which have ratified.

¹ Article 6, C182. Article 2, R190 specifies; "taking into consideration the views of the children directly affected by the worst forms of child labour, their families and, as appropriate, other concerned groups committed to the aims of the Convention and this Recommendation."

4. **Increased understanding of child labour amongst the public and civil society**, especially that its worst forms are criminal offences and of the relevant legislation and appropriate procedures, with roles and responsibilities of relevant state authorities identified.
5. **Increased state institutional capacity**, leading to legal enforcement, as well as increased protection for those exposing violations.
6. **Improved functioning of legislative, administrative and protective processes** relating to the worst forms of child labour, illustrating the harmonisation of domestic legislation with international legislation with a subsequent reduction in the number of new children entering the worst forms of child labour.
7. **Increased media coverage** across broadcast and print media, (including in local language press where relevant); increased capacity of partners to undertake media work.
8. **Lessons learned and improvements recommended** for future activity and project implementation identified as part of the evaluation period.

5. In achieving each of these outputs, all partners not only emphasised raising awareness amongst the broad range of key stakeholders, they also encouraged a multi-sectoral approach to reducing the numbers of children in WFCL. This is because a problem as complex as the WFCL can only be tackled effectively if everyone involved plays their part. By examining the effectiveness of partners' activities under each of these headings, this report will demonstrate that the project largely achieved its aims and objectives. Moreover, the combined wealth of partners' experiences and lessons learned from this project can hopefully be of use to others attempting to raise awareness of WFCL or indeed any issue that would benefit from these advocacy techniques.

6. This report encompasses information gleaned from the two annual narrative reports submitted to DfID, a feedback meeting attended by Anti-Slavery International, DNI, Peace Trust and WAO-Afrique in Florence in May 2004, and also partners' own project evaluations during April-July 2004. Partners' evaluations combined joint or individual meetings held with a number of key stakeholders involved in the project's activities with partners' own assessments of the project's success. Substantive and practical areas of the project were evaluated.

II Reviewing progress against project outputs

1. Strengthened civil society networks with good relations between NGOs, grass roots groups, religious institutions and unions; inclusion of non-traditional civil society partners, namely trade unions and employers; greater understanding of labour rights and ability to work together for same ends.

7. This objective stemmed from the fact that no action to combat WFCL can be effective and sustainable without strong cooperation between the various key stakeholders, including many civil society actors. For this to be possible, a minimum level of understanding of the issue had to be established. All partners reported improved interaction between different civil society groups as a result of the project.

8. NGOs' knowledge of WFCL and C182 increased, and many were brought together with common strategies to raise awareness further. For example, Peace Trust formed a group of 20 networking NGOs from throughout Tamil Nadu State. Following three NGO capacity building workshops, they were then also able to conduct awareness-raising and follow up activities with other groups, such as teachers and panchayat (local government) officials. DNI also specifically targeted other human rights and development NGOs in Costa Rica. A meeting in the first project year enabled DNI to assess the general level of understanding of C182 and WFCL, which was low. Subsequently they were able to develop and tailor methodologies for work to combat various forms of WFCL and incorporated it into NGO combined strategies, for example on NGO alternative reporting to Costa Rica's periodic report to the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child. DNI also created two manuals: "Prepare Yourself to Convince" on media relations for NGOs, and a "Proposal for a Conceptual and Methodological Approach to the Issue of Child Labour", which were backed up by training. DNI's evaluation clearly shows that NGOs in Costa Rica and thanks to DNI's extended network, even in some neighbouring countries, became better informed, equipped and motivated to work on the issue as a result of this process.

9. SPARC, ANPPCAN and WAO-Afrique incorporated NGOs into the full range of awareness-raising activities aimed at a wider group of participants. Although these activities were less specifically targeted at NGOs, they had other advantages in terms of bringing together disparate groups not used to working together and developing these relations for combined goals. For example, local level NGOs and Community Based Organisations (CBOs) in Pakistan learnt about C182 and WFCL alongside mainly local government officials, which greatly raised NGO profile among these government representatives and prompted subsequent follow up work together. Likewise, WAO-Afrique and ANPPCAN ensured NGOs participated in general awareness-raising meetings. Notably, ANPPCAN's two national level meetings, organised on 10 December 2002 and 9 April 2003, which also involved government, trade unions and employers. This helped to establish a pattern of working together from the outset, and later manifested for example in the reinvigoration of the National Steering Committee comprising a range of key stakeholder groups.

10. Great efforts were also made to include non-traditional civil society partners, largely with positive results not only in terms of developing awareness of WFCL but also galvanising these groups to work together in combating it. Clearly foremost among these were trade unions and employers. Trade unions generally responded well both to their inclusion in general activities (SPARC, WAO-Afrique, and ANPPCAN) or specifically targeted workshops (DNI and Peace Trust, for example, both held events specifically for trade unions in the first year). It certainly helped that some partners, notably Peace Trust, ANPPCAN and WAO-Afrique, already enjoyed good working relationships with key trade unions before the start of the project. Moreover, many trade unions were previously aware of C182 and WFCL and some had started conducting their own awareness-raising activities. Employers proved a greater challenge to involve across

the board. All partners found this group more reticent to admit, at least publicly, the existence of WFCL in all its forms. This was coupled with less coherence as a group generally, thereby also hindering the practical facilitation of action by employers to combat WFCL. There were some notable successes however. For example, WAO-Afrique's meeting with employers in May 2003, also attended by Anti-Slavery International and the full range of stakeholders in Togo, established good relations with employers and set in motion a number of positive initiatives, such as the creation of a child labour focal point, which is now operational and in frequent contact with WAO-Afrique. ANPPCAN successfully incorporated the Federation of Kenyan Employers into all stakeholder meetings. In Costa Rica, DNI also noted that the National Chamber of Commerce (UCCAEP) made child labour a key priority as a result of the project. It seems the more successful examples were due either to an already existing willingness to work on the issue by the employers concerned (Federation of Kenyan Employers) or else sustained and well-targeted efforts by partners to include them (DNI and WAO-Afrique). SPARC, which reported the greatest reticence from employers, acknowledged that in their case greater progress was also hindered by the absence of any contact with such groups prior to the project and, because SPARC had prioritised other areas, they had also had limited time and resources to develop new links with employers' groups fully. However, they were confident that this obstacle could be overcome eventually, should they invest more time on it in the future.

10. Interestingly most partners encouraged other groups to participate, which was particularly effective for getting messages across to key areas of the population according to local context. For example, WAO-Afrique's inclusion of religious leaders from all faiths and tribal chiefs who in Togo hold pivotal positions of respect in rural areas, was essential for reaching these communities who are particularly vulnerable to WFCL. As a direct result, religious groups have formed committees, which meet regularly to tackle the WFCL. In Tamil Nadu, Peace Trust made a particular point of incorporating Women Self Help Groups to work with village communities. These non-traditional partners are often overlooked in terms of C182 implementation. However, their achievements in this project bear out DNI and Peace Trust's assertion of the vital need for such groups to be sensitised and included in action to combat WFCL for efforts to be truly effective.

11. In different ways, all partners placed an emphasis on involving children and families in the project with effective results. Notably, WAO-Afrique ensured that child labourers joined in many activities during the project period, through the organised group, Enfants Jeunes Travailleurs (EJT – Child and Youth Workers), including the female branch of this organisation, thereby enabling them to address other stakeholders directly on several occasions. ANPPCAN involved children in their campaign work. For example, they assisted school children to make posters for a march, and perform plays, poems and songs about WFCL and appeal for action for "International Labour Day" on 1 June each year. In 2004, children presented a memorandum to the Labour Minister asking for increased funding and staffing of the Child Labour Division in the Ministry of Labour and a memorandum with similar recommendations to the Director of Children Services and more recently to the Parliamentary Committee on Social Services. The views in the memorandum were generated through children consultative forums and consolidated at ANPPCAN Regional Office in consultation with the children's cabinet. While SPARC reported a low level of child participation in their provincial and district level consultations, they nevertheless incorporated the selection process for children to participate in the May 2004 World Congress in Florence into their activities. The World Congress aimed to give child labourers from all over the world a platform to share experiences and propose solutions to end child labour. The selection process enabled children to narrate their own experiences, a unique experience in Pakistan. The children proved to be extremely powerful advocates for the WFCL issue. For example, the Assistant Director of Pakistan Bait-ul-Maal was

so impressed by the Pershwar meeting, the Bait-ul-Mal introduced similar monthly awareness-raising activities in all their schools nationwide. Peace Trust was also able to assist children directly through their project activities with children. They worked with teachers to create a network of child rights groups (CRGs) in 311 schools across Tamil Nadu in the second project year. These children were able to communicate particularly effectively with their peers, for example by visiting villages to identify child labourers and encourage them to return to school. Combined, these actions indicate the importance of consulting children's views meaningfully, and the effective role they can play as advocates for the WFCL issue too among their peers and decision-makers alike.

12. All partners highlighted the need for continuous action with all civil society groups to maintain the high level of momentum beyond this project, as well as to strengthen and expand these achievements further in the future.

2. Increased inter-ministry communication, collaboration and coherence on child labour matters. This in turn will lead to continued government commitment and understanding on the issue of the worst forms of child labour, which should then devolve down to local government level.

13. All partners managed to increase relevant government officials' awareness of C182 and WFCL, and in some cases succeeded in improving communication, collaboration and coherence at an inter-ministerial level. Much also depended on the openness of respective national governments and individual civil servants to collaborating for change. Significant improvements were made through bringing civil society actors and relevant government officials together at the same events, enabling the sharing of related experiences and competencies and building of mutual trust. As a result all partners noted that government ministries demonstrated greater interest in cooperating with the NGOs and other civil society partners involved by the end of the project period, which enhanced C182 implementation.

14. ANPPCAN was successful in developing inter-ministerial as well as civil society and Government interactions (see output 1 above). Advances in this respect were also attributed to the change of Government in late 2002, which, among other things, improved inter-ministerial communication generally. At the beginning of 2003, for example, the Government introduced free primary education in Kenya. ANPPCAN reported that this enabled thousands of children otherwise engaged in WFCL or on the streets to go to school. In order to guide the implementation of this policy, the Ministry of Education organised several consultation meetings involving the wide range of civil society partners as well as other ministries, including the Ministries of Health and Labour.

15. Likewise, the project enabled WAO-Afrique successfully to bring relevant government ministries together, despite initially at least being hampered by heavy bureaucracy and an uncertain political climate around the presidential elections on 1 June 2003. There was a good level of participation from the Ministries of Labour, Social Affairs, Education, Interior, and Tourism and Defence throughout the project, which had a positive effect on the Government's overall vision for child rights in Togo. Above all, the determination of the Ghanaian Government to act on the issue displayed at the Ghanaian/Togolese consultation in Accra, 11-13 October 2003, considerably influenced the Togolese Government. Since then, for example, WAO-Afrique noted that there have been meetings between the Interior and Defence ministries of both countries to try to stem cross-border trafficking, leading to several trafficked children being turned back from the border by INTERPOL. Following its success, WAO-Afrique intend to arrange more regional level meetings in the future to enable Togolese Ministries to share experiences with and learn from their counterparts in other countries.

16. Progress in Costa Rica on the other hand was hindered on this front by many external factors, not least confusion in the Government over which department should lead on combating WFCL despite an ongoing Government commitment to do so. However, through a combination of the high regard in which DNI's expertise on child labour issues is held in Costa Rica and the evident effectiveness of their key activities, DNI were able to turn around initial government suspicions towards their C182 awareness-raising activities, once the Government realised their relevance to the Government's own commitment to conducting official consultations.

17. Both Tamil Nadu and national government acknowledged the need for concerted intergovernmental action at all levels to eliminate child labour notwithstanding the fact that India has still not ratified C182. For example, national government officials from the Ministries of Labour, Information and Broadcasting, Welfare, Rural Development, and Women and Child Development are members of the National Authority for the Elimination of Child Labour with a view to developing measures to tackle the problem. Although it remains to be seen how the situation will progress following the change of Government in May 2004. Furthermore, Peace Trust noted in their evaluation that a relatively small number of national and state officials have a clear understanding of the need for C182 ratification, which indicates that more targeted action is needed with government officials at all levels.

18. While few SPARC activities targeted government officials at national level, both SPARC and ANPPCAN in particular managed to facilitate the devolution of this process at local government level: SPARC through their series of provincial and district consultations, which brought local government officials and elected representatives together with local civil society groups. In most cases this had never happened before and in one case, it even marked the first time that child labour issues and possible solutions had been discussed at the district level. All the meetings resulted in many promises for action but to date only limited action has been taken. Nevertheless, there have been some encouraging developments, such as ongoing dialogue between local government officials and civil society and a few specifically targeted follow-up activities. Notably in Abbottabad, a meeting jointly organised by the Labour Department and SPARC's local Child Rights Committee (CRC) specifically targeted at employers to sensitise them to their responsibilities under the Employment of Children Act.

19. ANPPCAN reached the local level through their C182 training for trainers (TOT) model workshops for Area Advisory Councils (AAC) and District Child Labour Committees (DCLCs). This training was then reproduced by DCLC and AAC members at divisional level by those trained through Divisional Child Labour Committees (DIVCLCs), reaching a total of 2280 participants throughout the project period. Most of those who benefited from the training were local government officials. Heads of government departments who were AAC and DCLC members enjoyed enhanced communication and collaboration among themselves and also with ANPPCAN largely as a result of these joint meetings and activities: DCLC and DIVCLC structures were created by ANPPCAN for the project. There is now a strong commitment from all involved to expand the training further if funding becomes available. ANPPCAN also established links with the already existing Coalition on Child Rights and Child Protection in Kenya, an inter-agency arrangement comprising national government departments and Nairobi City Council, NGOs and hospitals. In this way they were able to introduce WFCL situations into the quick response services the Coalition provided to children. Available records show that 300 WFCL cases were reported to Help Desks in Nairobi alone, which led to court cases, out of court settlements and the return of children to their rural homes and schools as appropriate. As a result of their success in Nairobi, ANPPCAN and the Coalition is keen to replicate the idea in other districts.

20. Based on this experience, both ANPPCAN and SPARC strongly advocate the need for continued, intensive and expanded grass-roots awareness-raising and training to take place to reach those who need it most for C182 implementation to be truly meaningful and sustainable. This strategy enabled local people to become fully involved in the project implementation process, which enhanced a feeling of ownership and motivated them to act, thereby assisting the project to reach more people. In all cases, both national and local, partners agreed that ongoing follow-up with government representatives is required. Immediately after the activities, follow-up is needed to ensure promises made by government representatives are actually carried out. There will also be a need for further training and workshops in the longer-term to account for the turnover in office holders in government departments and also periodically to remind governments of the continued urgency to combat WFCL long after the initial enthusiasm generated by meetings and workshops has passed. ANPPCAN's experience with the National Steering Committee and DCLCs and DIVCLCs also demonstrates the value of establishing or revitalising structures to facilitate ongoing inter-ministerial and civil society stakeholder consultation beyond the project's life-time.

3. Ratification of Convention 182 in India, and consolidation of National Plans of Action which reflect the concerns of civil society, employers' and workers' groups, children and their families in countries which have ratified.

21. **a) Ratification of Convention 182 in India:** This had not happened by the end of the project and was an unrealistic target for a project, which focused specifically on Tamil Nadu rather than India as a whole. The time and financial resources were simply not available to mount a serious campaign at national level on the issue. Nevertheless, Peace Trust reported that the examination of national laws and practices and inter-ministerial and tri-partite consultations are ongoing at national level. Moreover, Peace Trust's State level conference on 29 June 2003 with over 800 participants successfully moved the issue forwards at State-level. Peace Trust prepared for the meeting with a calendar mail-shot, and individual meetings with Members of Parliament (MPs) and Members of the Legislative Assembly (MLAs). This contributed to the successful outcome of the June meeting notwithstanding a political climate at the time not conducive to ratification. Notably, despite emphasising that child labour was a domestic issue that did not require international interference, the Labour Minister joined all participating MPs and MLAs in formally pledging support for C182 ratification. A local MP promised to present a private members bill for C182 ratification in the forthcoming session of Parliament. The change of Government in May 2004, with new MPs, made it difficult to capitalise more on the success of this workshop in terms of ratification. Following individual consultations with government officials and politicians, Peace Trust are convinced that the Government would be likely to respond to a mass grass-roots campaign calling for C182 ratification. They would like to be able to organise this in the future, combined with meetings targeted at separate political parties to push for ratification.

22. **b) Consolidation of National Plans of Action:** In most cases it is difficult to attribute any progress or not in consolidating the National Plans of Action to partners' activities as no specific activities were targeted at achieving this outcome, although particularly in the Kenyan and Costa Rican cases, both Governments were clearly greatly influenced by ANPPCAN and DNI's initiatives and viewed them as complementary if not integral components in the consultation process (see output 2 above). Notably, ANPPCAN have reported that aside from the recommendations now included in the draft labour law still under review by the Attorney General (see output 6 above), the Ministry of Labour's Child Labour Division developed a national action plan against child labour and funds are now being sought to implement the proposed programme. The plan has received unprecedented support from the Ministry of Labour

and Human Resource Development and the Vice President's Office. Already an inter-ministerial committee has been constituted to look into the plan and see how child labour issues can be mainstreamed in their respective ministries. The ILO has also promised to support part of the proposed plan within the Time Bound Programme framework. ANPPCAN played a key role in developing the action plan both in the consultative forums and drafting with a team of experts. Similarly, ANPPCAN has continued to voice issues of education as they relate to child labour and recommendations have been taken up by the Ministry of Education and other relevant ministries. Plans are being developed in the Ministry of Education to address transition particularly for the 14-18 years age category and one of the objectives is to expand secondary education opportunities to improve access and revamp vocational training as this is happening within and immediately after the period of implementation of the Convention 182 advocacy project and with inputs from ANPPCAN.

23. In all cases, project activities have encouraged governments to consult more widely not just with trade unions and employers but also NGOs and to some extent also take on board the views and involvement of children, families and non-traditional civil society partners, such as religious groups, tribal leaders, consumer and women's groups. In Togo, WAO-Afrique's efforts at bringing diverse groups together to work on the issue in fact marked the first time that the tripartite group (government, employers and trade unions) had discussed jointly ways and means to eradicate WFCL in Togo. WAO-Afrique are confident that these links, having proved to be mutually beneficial, will be developed further in future.

4. Increased understanding of child labour amongst the public and civil society, especially that its worst forms are criminal offences and of the relevant legislation and appropriate procedures, with roles and responsibilities of relevant state authorities identified

24. All partners carried out activities to increase understanding among civil society and the public using media techniques. Some also used more traditional methods, such as folk groups in Togo and large public campaigns and rallies in Tamil Nadu and Pakistan. Moreover, at the start of the project, ANPPCAN and WAO-Afrique translated an existing brochure explaining C182 in an accessible way and already available in French and English, into local languages. DNI's media manuals and methodologies (see output 1 above) also contributed greatly to civil society understanding, which, once these methodologies and media techniques have been fully implemented, should lead to greater understanding among the wider public.

25. 1500 copies of the brochure, "Do you know ... about the new ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention?",² were printed in each of the languages (Kiswahili, Ewe and Tsui) and all have been distributed at meetings, trainings and individually to a range of government, public, NGO and other key civil society contacts in Nairobi, Lomé and Accra, but also to rural communities. Copies were also given to radio stations as they are predominantly oral languages. Recipients gave very positive feedback and demand has far outstripped supply. As at October 2004, there had also been 675 downloads of the Kiswahili version and 358 of the Ewe from the Anti-Slavery International website. Unfortunately it has not been possible to obtain the electronic version of the Tsui translation from WAO-Afrique's Ghanaian contacts who created it. With additional funding, ANPPCAN and WAO-Afrique would welcome printing further copies as there is a strong preference for the booklet rather than pdf format.

26. All partners made effective use of the media in all its forms and in the range of local languages to cover activities and for specially targeted pieces to increase understanding of

² Original brochure published in English, French and Spanish in 2001 by the Geneva NGO Group for the Convention on the Rights of the Child Sub-Group on Child Labour.

WFCL and C182. Notably, WAO-Afrique produced a video in the first project year, based on the novel, “le Journal d’une Bonne” (Diary of a Domestic Servant) 200 copies were produced with English subtitles and towards the end of the second project distributed widely, including to television stations in Togo and across the region: Bénin, Burkina-Faso, Gabon, Guinea, Niger and Ghana. It is too early to assess the impact of the video on television audiences. However, initial reactions from other NGOs have been enthusiastic, and several expressed a wish to incorporate film-making in their own awareness-raising activities as a result. SPARC also produced a documentary style video on the life of a girl child in Lahore’s red light district for much the same purpose. However, the sensitive nature of the subject matter limited its distribution to civil society partners and not the general public. Most partners also conducted training for other key partners in how to work with the media, which should help disseminate the issue further still. An evaluation of the media coverage gained will be discussed in more detail in the dedicated item below (see output 7).

27. More traditional mass campaigning techniques also proved successful. While unable to reach the same number of people as the mass media, the traditional methods used were effective in terms of developing deeper understanding and greater levels of motivation through participants’ active involvement in these particular events. SPARC produced hundreds of banners, and thousands of flyers and posters for the “Child Labour Free Week” they organised in November each year. SPARC gave a conservative estimate that 10,000 people directly participated each year, with signs that the campaign is gaining momentum year on year, involving more districts and activities. SPARC found their strong Pakistan-wide network of CRCs and partners invaluable in achieving this. They also noted that the “Child Labour Free Week” and provincial and district level consultations complemented one another well, ensuring maximum levels of involvement in both and likely enhancing levels of understanding. Similarly, Peace Trust produced thousands of awareness-raising materials which were used for several meetings, rallies and mobile campaigns throughout the project period, and which they estimate involved nearly 3,000,000 people in one way or another. WAO-Afrique’s campaign with religious leaders, where they were also helped by traditional tribal chiefs, took their message directly to people in vulnerable rural communities during both project years. Folk groups also succeeded in getting the message across in an accessible and enjoyable way, encouraging everyone to dance and sing. Each time, the campaign attracted large crowds, including a high proportion of women and children. The underlying aim was to inform the public in both Ewe and French about WFCL and the laws in place to protect children from various forms of exploitation.

28. In addition to that many of the workshops and meetings for civil society in general also prompted participants to conduct their own awareness-raising activities among the general public thereafter. For example, of the 2280 people who benefited from ANPPCAN’s training model (see output 2 above) many in their turn carried out sensitisation activities and mobilisation among their own community members. ANPPCAN re-visited seven districts for their evaluation and found that 370 children had been removed from WFCL situations in these districts, of which 250 can be attributed to the Vihiga District alone.

5. Increased state institutional capacity, leading to legal enforcement, as well as increased protection for those exposing violations.

29. This output applied only to Peace Trust, ANPPCAN and WAO-Afrique. Each recorded progress in their respective countries as a result of incorporating enforcement officials into general project activities, although more remains to be done across the board to increase state institutional capacity for legal enforcement.

30. Specifically targeted events proved particularly effective. For example, Peace Trust's meeting for labour inspectors from six northern districts in Tamil Nadu State on 8 October 2003 was the first time inspectors had had the opportunity to come together to share experiences. It also allayed their previously existing fears about NGO agendas, enabling Peace Trust and labour inspectors to agree joint activities. By November 2003, they had formed a squad to rescue child labourers and conducted raids on spinning mills in the Dindigul area that led to three cases under investigation concerning 13 children under 14 years. The following month cases were also filed against employers concerning seven boys found in tea stalls, a bakery and electricity shop. Since the meeting, Peace Trust also noted prosecutions have increased in participants' districts. In Vellore, for example, 62 cases had been filed January-March 2004, compared with 62 over the whole of 2003. Labour inspectors also organised awareness-raising events in Vellore, Viluppuram, Viruthunagar, Tirunelveli, Coimbatore, Chennai, Karur and Dindigul. However, more remains to be done to target labour inspectors in the remaining districts. Moreover, labour inspectors' jurisdiction is limited. It is necessary to raise awareness among factory inspectors and revenue departments too for the enforcement of laws covering children in agriculture, stone quarries, mines, brick kilns and factories. However, external factors prevented Peace Trust from repeating this success with activities targeting the judiciary. In Tamil Nadu, official restrictions prohibit the judiciary from meeting in open forum. Peace Trust continued contacting individuals directly but acknowledge that more sustained sensitisation work is needed. Nevertheless, as a result of Peace Trust lobbying, the Tamil Nadu Government established Child Welfare Committees (CWC) in 18 districts (Chennai, Chengalpattu, Ranipet, Cuddalore, Dharmapuri, Erode, Salem, Coimbatore, Virudhunagar, Dindigul, Karaikudi, Tuticorin, Thanjavur, Tiruchi, Madurai, Tirunelveli, Nagappattinam and Tiruvallur) under the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2000. Each CWC will consist of a chairperson and four members, with powers similar to a metropolitan or judicial magistrate. Peace Trust is a member of the Dindigul CWC and hopes NGOs will participate in other CWCs.

31. WAO-Afrique also noted improvements among enforcement officials in Togo as a result of new legal measures to protect WFCL victims prompted by government involvement in their activities. For example, 20 labour inspector positions have been created to cover different forms of child labour, international standards and national regulations. There have also been logistical improvements, notably the provision of motorcycle transport to assist six newly established focal points, established by the Government to work with NGOs in identifying and rescuing children from WFCL. Lack of transportation was also one of the aspects that the Tamil Nadu labour inspectors had identified, which restricted them from carrying out their enforcement role.

32. ANPPCAN also reported progress. The project commenced at a time when the Kenyan Children Act 2001 came into force. Awareness of its provisions among enforcement officials was very low at the start of the project. The activities, notably the district and divisional level training workshops throughout both project years and the workshop targeting police, lawyers, and the judiciary which after a number of delays due to external factors eventually took place on 5 December 2003, raised awareness among the full range of enforcement officials and judiciary who participated of their responsibilities under both C182 and the Children Act. At this last meeting, many participants confessed to hearing about these laws for the first time, and called for specialised training for enforcement officers and legal professionals with child protection responsibilities to be extended to sensitise more officers as many ignorant of C182 and national WFCL provisions. In their evaluation, ANPPCAN recorded a significant change in officials' attitude and approach to children's issues, noting for example that police treat children in a more friendly way and magistrates are increasingly taking decisions in the "best interest of the child".

33. Interestingly, although not an output they were pro-actively working towards, SPARC noted a number of successes following their provincial and district level consultations and workshops,

which labour inspectors attended. Following these meetings, the number of child labour inspections nearly doubled in NWFP. Also, some labour inspectors joined their local Child Rights Committee and one inspector commented to SPARC that his attitude to inspecting had changed as a result of participating in SPARC's workshop.

6. Improved functioning of legislative, administrative and protective processes relating to the worst forms of child labour, illustrating the harmonisation of domestic legislation with international legislation with a subsequent reduction in the number of new children entering the worst forms of child labour.

34. Again, this output applied only to ANPPCAN, WAO-Afrique and Peace Trust. These partners noted a number of achievements, although more still needs to be done. It is presumed that these successes combined with other areas of progress will lead to significantly reduced numbers of children entering WFCL. However, at the time of writing it is still too early to be able to verify with precise figures.

35. ANPPCAN witnessed the strongest improvements in this regard by ably taking advantage of helpful external factors, such as the change of Government. The project also took place at a time when the National Task Force Reviewing Labour Laws was collecting views from stakeholders. ANPPCAN used project activities, notably the 10 December 2003 and 9 April 2003 seminars, to mobilise civil society and government partners to prepare recommendations for the Task Force review. The Task Force has since submitted their report to the Attorney General and it incorporated some recommendations from ANPPCAN and partners, such as those concerning the criminalisation of the WFCL. A draft Employment Bill is being prepared, and lobbying will continue once this has been presented to Parliament. The formation and revitalisation of the National Steering Committee (NSC), bringing together government departments and civil society organisations dealing with child labour issues, as a result of the same two seminars has also been a milestone for improving processes relating to WFCL in Kenya. Not only does it provide a forum for consultation, it also, for example, played a central role in consolidating partners' recommendations and presenting them to the Task Force. In addition, the NSC decided to establish a permanent National Child Labour Resource Centre in the Ministry of Labour, housing a collection of materials on WFCL from around the world. Moreover, at the local level, the DCLCs and DIVCLCs, created by the project in collaboration with government officials and communities in the project area, now meet regularly to review the situation of children in their area and formulate programmes aimed at combating child labour in a way that is appropriate to the local context. They are now officially recognised structures, which the Government uses to implement programmes at the district and community levels. Also encouragingly, the Ministry of Finance increased funding for child labour issues in the Ministry of Labour and at local level through the AACs during the project period.

36. In November 2002, Peace Trust was invited to give their input into a new Child Labour Action Plan, as part of the State Government's 15 Point Programme for Tamil Nadu, and a new Child Labour Law. The Child Labour Action Plan was announced in October 2003 and proposed several strategies to eliminate child labour in all hazardous occupations by 2005 and in all non-hazardous occupations by 2007. Since then the Tamil Nadu State Government has made a number of initiatives, including anti-poverty schemes, and encouragingly has begun cooperating more closely with labour inspectors, education officers and NGOs on child labour issues. However, Peace Trust challenged the Government's estimate of 70,334 child labourers in the State. Peace Trust have argued that the survey was incomplete and 800,000-1,000,000 was a more accurate figure. At the local level, panchayat members (local government officials) who participated in specifically targeted workshops throughout March 2003 have since undertaken a

number of initiatives. For example, in ten districts they introduced special allocations in anti-poverty schemes for families who send their child labourers back to school. Many who participated in the training also had subsequent meetings with employers to discuss child labour and rehabilitation packages. As a result children who return to school have been assisted with educational materials, panchayat leaders have also conducted campaigns in schools. Following the success of the panchayat workshops, they would like to expand the training to cover the remaining districts in Tamil Nadu in the future should funds permit.

37. WAO-Afrique also noted some improvements as a result of their activities. Their focus on developing links with relevant government departments paid dividends. The Government finally managed to identify the lead department for child protection, the lack of which had caused problems for a considerable length of time. Henceforth, the Ministry for Social Affairs is charged with coordinating government policy on child protection. In addition, as mentioned above, the Government created six focal points charged with working with NGOs on child labour issues. There is one for each administrative region and one for the Golfe Préfecture, an administrative district in one of the regions, which includes the capital city, Lomé. However, to date it has been difficult to get specific information about their activities as it has not been made public. WAO-Afrique will continue pressing for this information to be made available.

7. Increased media coverage across broadcast and print media, (including in local language press where relevant); increased capacity of partners to undertake media work.

38. All partners attracted a high level of media coverage of their events throughout the project period, and many also conducted successful media campaigns. DNI, ANPPCAN, SPARC and Peace Trust also carried out media training for key partners. Media training had originally been planned for WAO-Afrique. However, consultation with a range of Togolese partners highlighted the need for such training to be sustained over a period of time. This had not been foreseen in the original project budget and so these funds were reallocated to other areas of the project in Togo. Nevertheless, the combined effect of partners' media activities resulted in significant increases in media coverage of WFCL and C182 in all countries concerned, and in many cases improved media relations as well as an increase in the media's own understanding of WFCL issues were detected. It is also important to draw particular attention to the fact that SPARC, Peace Trust, ANPPCAN and WAO-Afrique placed considerable emphasis on generating media coverage in local languages (Urdu, Tamil, Kiswahili and Ewe respectively) to achieve maximum effectiveness in getting messages across to communities most vulnerable to WFCL.

39. As a key part of their project objectives, DNI successfully increased media coverage and developed civil society capacity for working with the media. As mentioned above, they created two successful manuals having consulted widely among the media and NGOs: "Prepare Yourself to Convince" on media relations for NGOs, and a "Proposal for a Conceptual and Methodological Approach to the Issue of Child Labour". 500 copies were printed in Spanish and a further 500 for the English translation, and distributed mainly among civil society. The "Prepare Yourself to Convince" launch on 25 February 2004 was accompanied by training for NGOs in media relations. The manuals and workshop generated positive feedback and DNI have already run out of the Spanish version of the manuals. To date they have also conducted five training sessions on working with the media for individual NGOs, and have been asked to do several more by large and small NGOs alike, which bodes well for the sustainability of these improvements. DNI have seen other civil society partners' ability and confidence to work with the media more effectively greatly strengthened as a result. Moreover, DNI also noticed that their own relations with the media had improved, notably following the extensive media consultations in preparing the media manual. DNI also reported not just increased approaches

from the media, but that these were now made in a more sophisticated and informed way. Due to the success of the manuals, DNI would like to print more copies and expand the training beyond Costa Rica to Central America too, and also plan to create a similar training package for work on adolescent groups. Although another time, they would prepare the manual at the outset of any new project to maximise its usefulness during the project period.

40. ANPPCAN together with Anti-Slavery International conducted media training 8-9 May 2003, primarily for civil society representatives, prior to a media campaign targeting national and local TV, radio, print and internet media through August 2003. They also consistently attracted wide media coverage for all their main activities throughout the whole project period. Initial feedback from participants was extremely positive, all respondents to the course evaluation questionnaire stated that they had increased their understanding of the media and confidence in using it. Many also indicated that they would like further training. As in the DNI example, ANPPCAN noted the huge benefits of media training for developing media interest in the WFCL and C182. This, combined with general media interest in ANPPCAN's activities, led directly to increased and improved media coverage of WFCL in Kenya and public accessibility to these issues as a result. For example, ANPPCAN recorded particular increases in the frequency and length of published features and articles on WFCL in the two leading national newspapers, the *Daily Nation* and the *East African Standard* following the media training and as a result of the campaign. The *Daily Nation* has a daily readership of 4,500,000 on weekdays and Saturdays and 5,000,000 on Sundays and The East African Standard, 540,000 Monday – Saturday and 750,000 on Sundays. Other lower circulation newspapers, such as the *People Daily*, *Citizen Weekly* and the *Kenya Times Daily* also regularly covered ANPPCAN events. ANPPCAN also attracted coverage in major TV stations, including *KBC* with 79% viewership, as well as radio stations with listenerships averaging 55% in Nairobi and between 35-93% in Nairobi and selected towns. This is not including the number of radio listeners in rural areas, for which figures are not available, but where it is recognised that radio forms the major source of news and educational information.

41. WAO-Afrique, Peace Trust and SPARC also generated extensive media interest. WAO-Afrique reported an increase both in terms of quantity and quality in reporting on WFCL. WAO-Afrique already enjoyed good relations with both State and private newspaper, radio and TV groups, many actively participating in project activities as well as reporting on them. This has further helped to develop media interest in children's well-being in Togo. For example, a private radio station, which was a particularly active partner during the project, *Radio Zéphyr*, now broadcasts a programme every Sunday on child rights, and frequently include interviews with NGOs. Notwithstanding the prohibitively high fees demanded by the national Togolese State TV channel to broadcast features, WAO-Afrique attracted regular interest from *TV7* and *TV2* as well as the national TV stations of numerous national TV stations throughout West Africa (see output 4 above) to show the video of "Journal d'une Bonne".

42. Peace Trust and its partner networking NGOs produced a steady stream of news releases on project activities and WFCL. This resulted in a high level of coverage in Tamil and English language and local and national newspapers with a combined circulation of 3,760,000 in the first year and a moderate increase to 3,980,000 in the second. In addition, Peace Trust conducted training on media relations and editing skills for NGOs in January and June 2003. They also gathered case studies during October 2003, which were highlighted, for example, in *The Hindu*, a national English newspaper and *Dhinamani*, a Tamil newspaper. Feedback from media at a subsequent press conference in February 2004 echoed the usefulness of case studies to generate more interest among the media to highlight WFCL. These cases gained considerable media coverage, particularly on radio and TV. Encouraged by this success, Peace Trust would like to organise field trips for media representatives in future in addition to issuing press releases.

43. SPARC's success at gaining media coverage for their annual "Child Labour Free Week" campaign and their provincial and district level workshops (see annex 2) was outstanding, and particularly encouraging for grass-roots awareness-raising. SPARC also noted an improvement in the quality of coverage following the workshops, notably in the language and sensitivity of stories. During workshops, local NGOs had complained that the media often were not interested in their activities. However, journalist participants commented that many NGOs did not understand how the media operated, a misunderstanding, which limited their media effectiveness when presenting information to gain media attention. By the end of the project, however, SPARC noted much better relations between NGOs and media, evidenced for example by the greater numbers of journalists contacting SPARC and other NGOs which attended the workshops for information on WFCL and child rights. However, SPARC have not yet detected much progress in terms of journalists themselves initiating stories about WFCL.

44. Both Peace Trust and SPARC noted obstacles to their gaining yet wider media coverage: Peace Trust was not able to convince media allied to the Government party to publish or broadcast on WFCL. Also SPARC's noted that journalists' hesitancy to initiate stories and features on WFCL reflected a more general trends and capacity in journalism in Pakistan. The high level of media interest all partners managed to create was undoubtedly also helped by the high regard in which they had all previously been held by the media in their respective countries as reliable sources of information. They all also noted the need for sustained efforts over a longer period to develop journalists' skills in reporting on WFCL further as well as mutually beneficial relationships between the media and NGOs.

8. Lessons learned and improvements recommended for future activity and project implementation.

a) Strengths

45. **Events bringing groups together:** Joint activities proved useful for developing understanding and trust among groups not used to working together, sharing experiences and agreeing joint strategies and activities in the future. In many cases partners' project activities marked the first occasion that disparate groups had sat around the table together. All partners held joint events, which led to new and improved partnerships in combating WFCL.

46. **Events targeting specific groups:** Activities targeted specifically at particular groups were useful where a particular group felt more comfortable discussing any sensitive issues or for tackling particular areas of C182 or WFCL in more depth, such as from law enforcement or media perspectives. Again, all partners made good use of this alternative to focus on particular groups or aspects of C182.

47. **Outreach to local level:** Official discussions and interventions around C182 tend to be focused in capitals. However, the most vulnerable children are often in remote areas away from the capitals and most of the decisions directly affecting these children are taken at local and district levels. While evident in all partners' work, SPARC and ANPPCAN, through their consultations, workshops and training paid special attention to building commitment and capacity to intervene among key stakeholders at the local/grassroots level. These programmes need to be reviewed, further improved and extended to ensure the sustainability of partners' achievements in the longer-term. Such programmes will likely also need repeating to account for staff turn-over.

48. **Outreach to non-traditional partners:** Partners experienced the value of involving non-traditional actors/groups and strengthening their capacities in the fight against the exploitation of child labour. From the project experience, groups such as "Cooperativas" (small-holder cooperative movement) and "Mesa Campesina" (a grass roots peasant association of working

children) in Costa Rica and religious groups and traditional tribal chiefs clearly have essential contributions to make and must be included if C182 is to be fully implemented.

49. Developing understanding for maximum results: Partners established the level of understanding at the outset and then adapted awareness-raising and capacity-building techniques accordingly. For example, Peace Trust lobbied MPs and MLAs extensively about C182 and WFCL to ensure they were well informed before they attended the June 2003 seminar, at which a number formally pledged their support for C182 ratification. DNI established the level of understanding among diverse civil society groups at meetings held at the start of the project, which helped them to target follow-up activities, notably the manuals and training for civil society on child labour and media relations more effectively. As a result, Costa Rican NGOs started the project with little knowledge and commitment but felt more confident with the issue and had incorporated it into their joint advocacy priorities by the project's end. Such considered and strategic processes are encouraged for future sensitisation work.

50. Pro-active approach to the media: The media is an unprecedented tool for reaching vast numbers of people, including in less accessible rural places which are most vulnerable to WFCL. All partners understood and made full use of the full range of media for mass awareness-raising, mobilisation of the general public and other key actors to tackle the problem, publicising events and campaigns, and as an effective tool to help monitor the effectiveness of any measures taken. All Partners also ensured that information was available in all local languages represented to ensure maximum accessibility and most also conducted effective media training to ensure greater numbers of civil society partners could also use the media effectively.

51. Use of traditional campaign techniques: Although traditional techniques cannot reach the same number of people as the media, petitions, rallies and meetings also have their place because they require the active engagement of those involved and so arguably have a greater impact on those who actually participate in terms of greater understanding, commitment and motivation. This was certainly the case from partners' experience, notably SPARC's "Child Labour Free Week" activities and WAO-Afriques campaigns with religious leaders and tribal chiefs in rural communities. Their experiences support the view that such techniques should continue to be encouraged.

52. Effective use of video: WAO-Afrique's video adaptation of a story about a child domestic worker also showed the potential for film-making as an effective awareness-raising tool. "Journal d'une Bonne" has already encouraged other NGOs who have seen it to incorporate film-making into their work. However, SPARC's less successful experience with video-making demonstrates the need for thorough research into the subject matter and possible applications before embarking on this awareness-raising technique.

53. Translation of the C182 brochure into local languages: This greatly contributed to raising awareness of C182 and WFCL among target groups and populations, as well as helping to equip them for action. They also proved useful resources for training and workshops conducted by partners. Although there have been many downloads of the electronic versions available of the Anti-Slavery International website, hard copies proved particularly popular with demand outstripping supply in all cases. Funding is required to print and distribute more copies. Consideration should also be given to producing a follow-up brochure based on the lessons learned from this project on C182 and WFCL awareness-raising techniques. Other materials published in local languages, such as Peace Trust and SPARC's various booklets, posters and leaflets also proved effective at getting complex messages across accessibly.

54. Training manuals and training workshops: Most groups who participated in project activities had little understanding of C182 at the outset of the project. Consequently, the methodologies, training manuals combined with workshops for NGOs, other civil society

groups, district and local level officials, and legal professionals proved very effective at bringing the various concerned groups up to speed on the complex issues involved. DNI's child labour and media manuals and accompanying training proved effective not only helping civil society better understand child labour issues but also equipping them to work on the issues and present them effectively in the media. Also of note, ANPPCAN's training for trainers (TOT) model enabled individuals to train others in their turn thereby benefiting a much greater number of people than ANPPCAN alone could have trained. All partners noted the need for more training and for it to be tailored for more groups. Feedback on training given should be analysed to improve and extend the manuals and workshops further than was possible with the time and resources available under this project to ensure that progress already achieved is maintained. Manuals should also be prepared at the earliest stage in a project life-time to ensure maximum benefit can be gained from it during the project period.

55. Holistic approach: Partners incorporated complementary international standards into their range of activities. Notably, ILO Convention 138 on Minimum Age, which provides for public and social policy to combat child labour through poverty reduction, and the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, which covers the full range of child rights. In addition, relevant national law was always included. C182 cannot be implemented in isolation, but as part of the full range of international standards complementary standards should also form part of any awareness-raising or capacity building activities.

56. Project planning and implementation: Partners targeted, planned and carried out their activities well, helping to generate high levels of interest and motivation as a result. Thorough planning also ensured that activities required few changes and ran as far as possible to the project schedule.

57. Coordination: Most partners said they experienced a good level of communication with Anti-Slavery International, although DNI would have liked more exchange in terms of both organisations' ongoing activities. The quarterly financial reporting and distribution system helped all concerned to keep better track of activities carried out, as well as planned and corresponding expenditure. Partners also appreciated the coordination role carried out by Anti-Slavery International in collecting partners' narrative reports and re-formulating them into a uniform reporting style. This approach was found to be sensitive to partners' diverse approaches and styles, and thereby helped partners to focus on project implementation.

58. External factors: Partners successfully capitalised on a number of helpful external factors, including:

- **Political will:** This was evident especially in the case of the new Government elected in Kenya in 2002. Their increased commitment to tackling WFCL presented ANPPCAN with a number of opportunities on which to capitalise. Where political will was less evident, for example in India, Peace Trust nevertheless found useful allies among the third largest political party, the PMK, which helped Peace Trust lobbying of MPs, MLAs and Ministers.
- **Respect for partners at national level:** All partners have considerable expertise in the field of child labour as well as a number of areas of advocacy and awareness-raising. As a result, they enjoyed a high level of respect and credibility among key groups at national level, notably among government representatives and the media, and in some cases also trade unions. This contributed to a strong level of cooperation, participation and interest from most quarters in the project activities from the outset.
- **Existing networks:** All partners made use of existing networks to help implement their activities and reach greater numbers of people. For example, SPARC made use of their

network of CRCs. DNI capitalised on the fact that Costa Rican NGOs came together to strategise for work on the alternative report to Costa Rica's forthcoming UN Committee on the Rights of the Child report.

b) Weaknesses

59. Child participation: Partners emphasised the inclusion of children in the project, through consulting children's groups to help inform recommendations and/or as powerful advocates among their peers or key decision-makers. However, more could have been done to develop ways to integrate children further in the project. Child participation could also have been included among the project outputs to be achieved.

60. Gender: Of particular concern was the fact that there were no objectives or outputs and few activities, which related to specific issues around women and girls. Likewise, little gender-specific information was recorded, for example, there was no breakdown and analysis of male/female participation in events. As in the case of child participation, the inclusion of a gender-specific output would have placed more focus on this issue from the outset and likely led to greater gender emphasis in the design, implementation and evaluation of the project as a whole.

61. Employers: All partners except ANPPCAN recorded particular problems involving employers in the project's aims and application. Despite noting progress with this group by the end of the project period in most cases, there remained a particular reluctance on the part of employers to admit the existence of WFCL in all its forms. This will require focused and sustained engagement to encourage employers to admit the full extent of the problem in the first instance to ensure genuine will to tackle it fully. However, the progress noted particularly by WAO-Afrique and DNI following their targeted attempts to get employers on board indicate that positive results are achievable with perseverance.

62. Ongoing demand for training: The success of the project has created a demand for training in C182 and WFCL particularly at the local level and among specific professional groups. Efforts should be made to fund and organise further training to ensure this demand can be met.

63. Working in two countries: The Ghana/Togo consultation in October 2003 produced highly effective outcomes in terms of strengthened partnerships and learning across borders, and WAO-Afrique would like to reproduce this model with other neighbouring countries. However, they experienced many practical difficulties in coordinating activities, including the preparation for this workshop, with their Ghanaian partners. This was notably due to the English/French language barrier and geographical distance between coordinators. In addition, interpretation costs were not included in the original budget proposal and so funds had to be reallocated from elsewhere. To date, it has not been possible to obtain the electronic version of the Tsui version of the C182 brochure, although samples of the hard copy have been received. In future, WAO-Afrique note it is essential for translation costs for meetings and meeting preparation are built in to the project from the start if work is to be undertaken in countries with different working languages.

64. Lack of direct contact between partners: The original project proposal did not include an opportunity for partners to meet and share experiences, and no funds remained to include it once the project was underway. In the event, DNI, Peace Trust, WAO-Afrique and Anti-Slavery International were able to take advantage of the fact that all were attending a conference in May 2004. However, it was not possible for all to attend. Moreover, a joint meeting would have been particularly useful mid-way through the project period to enable partners to discuss the project and any particular problems or successes with each other, while there was still an opportunity to make adjustments to their activities.

65. **Budget allocation:** There was insufficient budget in some cases to carry out the number of activities and in the number of districts intended. For example, ANPPCAN were unable to carry out the full number of district level workshops for this reason. The budget also underestimated some actual costs, for example, for translating the evaluation report into French and Spanish, preventing either translation. Some budgets also underestimated the time involved by staff in coordinating activities. Apart from Peace Trust, staff were seconded from other projects which sometimes caused workload problems. Future projects may need a budget line for dedicated project staff.

66. **Financial reporting:** The lack of a standard financial reporting format for partners led to confusion for one or two partners as to what information was required, and as a result there was some delay in forwarding necessary funds.

67. **Record-keeping:** Not all activities were reported on in full nor were all possible supporting documents gathered. This was particularly noticeable in the case of provincial and local level meetings. As a result the project may have achieved more than appears in existing reports.

68. **Lack of evaluation questionnaires:** The original project proposal indicated that evaluation questionnaires would be handed out and collected at each event. This was not the case at many events. Instead many project staff preferred to gather verbal feedback. However, partners carried out extensive follow-up evaluation through joint and individual meetings during the evaluation phase of the project, which had the advantage that it enabled additional information to be gathered about any lasting effects of the activities held.

69. **External factors:** Some external factors also hampered the potential effectiveness of the project. Some key examples were:

- **Lack of political will:** This was experienced in the case of the Government of Pakistan, which to date has failed to amend national legislation in line with C182. Also, elections in India and Togo during the project period delayed and disrupted implementing the project activities.
- **High turnover of government staff:** This hampered efforts to increase understanding among government officials. These problems were compounded by staff-turnover linked to changes in Government during the project period in Kenya and India. However, staff turn-over is inevitable. So attempts must be made to repeat training activities in C182 and WFCL or seek ways to incorporate it into Governments' own induction and training of relevant staff to ensure sustained understanding and motivation at Government level.
- **Lack of accurate data on WFCL numbers.** All partners remarked on the lack of accurate official statistics. Either they do not exist at all, for example in Togo, or where they have been collected, partners do not believe they reflect the true extent of the problem as in the Indian example (see output 6 above). This makes the impact of this project on WFCL numbers difficult to assess fully and, more importantly, will hamper governments' own efforts to target their responses to the problem where and how it is needed most. Accurate and effective data collection systems must be set up using existing structures at all levels. Data on children at work and at risk must be gathered and analysed regularly to identify priority areas for action and to help measure the success of action taken.

III. Conclusion and next steps

70. Over the period of 18 months, partners have through a wide range of well-targeted and executed activities achieved the projects' objectives. In all cases, partners have succeeded in strengthening and sustaining civil society networks in their respective countries. As this report clearly demonstrates, civil society networks in Costa Rica, Tamil Nadu, Kenya, Pakistan and Togo/Ghana are now better motivated, equipped and organised to work together on information-sharing, awareness-raising and advocacy opportunities for the effective implementation of C182 as well as increased understanding and support for it across the board from government officials through to the general public.

71. The ultimate goal of the project was to bring about the effective reduction of the WFCL in the countries represented through appropriate government action and involvement of civil society actors and public to strengthen and implement C182. However, in the event, it has not been possible to assess this due to the absence in each country of accurate WFCL data and effective systems for their collection. Moreover, it is likely also too soon after the project's completion for the full impact of many of the activities to be apparent. Nevertheless the clear progress made in terms of strengthened public and civil society awareness and involvement in C182 implementation as well as the improved government action identified in this report should reasonably lead to WFCL reductions if this initial momentum generated can be maintained and extended.

72. Partners have identified several common next steps in order to achieve this. These include:

- The need for accurate and reliable WFCL data to be gathered to identify the true extent and nature of the problem in each country and to facilitate the ongoing evaluation of the effectiveness of action taken.
- In India, mass public mobilisation campaigns should increase pressure on the Indian Government to ratify C182.
- States, who are already signatories to C182 are not only obliged to ensure domestication of C182, but this is a matter of priority for C182 provisions to be enforceable at national level. There is still a particular need in Pakistan for targeted campaigning to help bring about this crucial step before further progress is possible.
- Governments need to ensure that "all concerned groups" are systematically consulted for C182 implementation. ANPPCAN's example of the reactivated NSC in Kenya demonstrates the value and effectiveness of the existence of a formal structure for the success of this process. Funding should also be sought to ensure that formal structures and looser networks established in this project can continue.
- C182 must be implemented alongside the full range of relevant international standards and national standards. These complementary standards should also form part of any awareness-raising or capacity building activities.
- There is a need for ongoing C182 workshops and training. This includes those targeted at diverse stakeholder groups to encourage joint action and also those addressing the needs of specific groups, be they media, legal professionals or enforcement officials. It is vital that workshops and training are taken to the grass-roots to ensure the commitment and capacity at those levels which affect children most directly. Training for trainers is a good way of reaching greater numbers of relevant office-holders and decision-makers and also increasing a sense of ownership of the process at local level.
- All stakeholder groups at national and local levels need continued reminders of the urgency of action to eliminate WFCL.

- A particular effort is still required to make employers acknowledge all forms of WFCL and strengthen action to combat it.
- General public awareness-raising needs to continue, including both mass media and traditional campaign techniques to combine reaching the maximum number of people, including in rural areas, with approaches that encourage their active engagement in the issue.
- More copies of the C182 brochure in local languages should be printed and distributed, as well as other materials, which make C182 more accessible and relevant to every day life.
- Consideration should be given to developing a publication along the lines of the C182 brochure outlining the effective advocacy and awareness-raising techniques used and key lessons learned in this project to offer practical examples of action that can be taken by key C182 stakeholders in countries not involved in this particular project.

Annex 1: - List of acronyms

ANPPCAN	African Network for Prevention and Protection against Child Abuse and Neglect
AAC	Area Advisory Council
CBO	Community Based Organisation
CRC	Child Rights Committee
CRG	Child Rights Group
CWC	Child Welfare Committee
C182	ILO Convention 182 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour
DCLC	District Child Labour Committee
DIVCLC	Divisional Child Labour Committee
DfID	Department for International Development
DNI	Defensa de Niñas y Niños Internacional (Defence of Children International)
EJT	Enfants Jeunes Travailleurs (Child and Youth Workers)
MLA	Member of the Legislative Assembly
MP	Member of Parliament
NSC	National Steering Committee
NWFP	North West Frontier Province
R190	ILO Recommendation 190 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour
SPARC	Society for the Protection of the Rights of the Child
TOT	Training for Trainers
UCCAEP	National Chamber of Commerce (Costa Rica)
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour
WSHG	Women Self Help Group

Annex 2: List of available project-related materials

1. Produced by Defence for Children International, Costa Rica

- Annual project implementation narrative reports and quarterly financial reports sent to Anti-Slavery International
- End of project country evaluation report
- Year 1 activities:
 - Meeting involving NGOs and local groups, 14 May 2004: Meeting report.
 - Media training pack and campaign: “Prepárese para convencer” (“Prepare yourself to convince”), a manual for NGOs on media relations; “Reflexiones para el abordaje conceptual y metodológico del trabajo infantil y adolescente” (“Proposal for a conceptual and methodological approach to the issue of child and adolescent labour”), a guide for NGOs and Media on child labour issues; English translations of the manual and guide; Questionnaire for media in preparation of the manual and guide; Media questionnaire distribution list.
 - Training session for trade unions, 22 May 2003: Meeting report.
 - Meeting with National Employers Chambers and other employers’ groups, 16 May 2003: Meeting report.
 - Meeting with Members of Parliament, 6 August 2003: Meeting report (non-DfID funded).
- Year 2 activities:
 - Workshop, research groups, focus groups and meetings involving ILO tripartite groups and civil society to determine methodologies of intervention, 9 October 2003, 22 October 2003, 27 November 2003, 15 December 2003: Presentations and methodologies on child labour, rural child labour (especially agriculture), child domestic workers (focusing on education), urban child labour (focusing on street children).
 - Media training pack and campaign: Participant list, presentation, “gacetilla” (media announcement) for launch of Manual and training on 25 Feb 2004.

2. Produced by Peace Trust India (Tamil Nadu)

- Annual narrative project implementation reports and quarterly financial reports sent to Anti-Slavery International.
- End of project country evaluation report.
- Year 1 activities:
 - Awareness-raising materials: Poster calling for C182 ratification; booklet in Tamil on child labour; stickers; “Smile Again” CD; “Kandhaga Ganangal” (“Songs on Children in Fire”) audio-cassette; various newspaper clippings.
 - Training programmes focusing on particularly hazardous industries involving trade unions: Overall report and participant lists for 9 workshops (December 2002 – March 2003); photos of workshops; various newspaper clippings.
 - Meetings with employers: List of 56 individual employers met July –September 2003.
 - Training programme for teachers: Nine workshop reports; participant lists for 12 workshops; workshop agendas; sample training manual; photos of workshops; various newspaper clippings.
 - Workshop for Members of the State Legislative Assembly and Members of Parliament (MLAs/MPs), 29 June 2003: Desk calendars circulated prior to meeting; background dossier distributed to MLAs/MPs; agenda; participant list; report of meeting; official meeting banner with signatures; photos of meeting; various newspaper clippings.

- State level workshops for Panchayat leaders: Reports for seven workshops; participant lists for 10 workshops; agendas; leaflets; photos of workshops; newspaper clippings for ten workshops held March 2003.
- Workshop for administrative heads of districts jointly organised with Tamil Nadu Government's Department of Bonded and Child Labour: List of 60 enforcement officers met individually February -June 03.
- Capacity-building workshops for NGOs and quarterly networking meetings: Background dossier for NGOs; photos from June 2003 media relations workshop and February 2003 advocacy workshop.
- Discussion day for Chennai High Court and district judges and State Human Rights Commission: List of judges and HRC members met individually April -June 2003, compilation of relevant legal judgements.
- Year 2 activities:
 - Training for labour officers and factory inspectors, 8 October 2003: meeting report; accompanying dossier; agenda; participant list; photos of workshop; various newspaper clippings.
 - Meetings with Employers: List of 34 individuals met in Karur, Tiripur, Coimbatore, Vedasandur, Erode, and Chennai by 31 December 2003 (90 in total over project period); various newspaper clippings.
 - Discussion day for Chennai High Court and district judges and State Human Rights Commission: Compilation of judgements distributed to 140 lawyers October - December 2003.
 - List of schools where Child Rights Groups created and number of children involved.
 - "Child Labour in India" - book distributed at training events.
 - Poster advertising Workshop on Business Social Responsibility, 20 January 2004.
 - Labour and Employment Department, Tamil Nadu Government: "Action Plan for Eradication of Child Labour in Tamil Nadu," 12 May 2003.

3. Produced by the African Network for Prevention and Protection Against Child Abuse and Neglect, Kenya

- Annual narrative project implementation reports and quarterly financial reports sent to Anti-Slavery International.
- End of project country evaluation report.
- Year 1 activities:
 - Translation of "Do you know ... about the new ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention?" (original, 2001) into Kiswahili: Hard copy and pdf versions (available on Anti-Slavery International website: www.antislavery.org).
 - Advocacy for incorporation of Convention 182 and harmonisation with domestic legislation through meetings with ministries, workshop for unions and employers, 10 December 2002: Meeting report, participant list; newspaper clippings.
 - Inter-ministry and civil society seminar for those working on child labour, 9 April 2003: Meeting report, participant list; newspaper clippings.
 - Design of workshop model and plan to carry out training of local level government officials, district children's advisory committees and NGOs: Two training reports, covering: 1-Bondo, Suba, Homabay, Siaya, Kakamega, Vihiga, Teso, Busia, November 2002; 2-Kericho, Kiambu, Maragua, Butere-Mumias, April 2003.
 - 30 district level workshops using model - overall report, participant list.
 - Media training (conducted jointly with Anti-Slavery International), 8-9 May 2003: ANPPCAN's budget proposal for facilitating workshop; training agenda; training report; participant list; newspaper clippings.

- Media event and campaign, August 2003: Several press releases; Letter to the Editor, Daily Nation (no date); 2 x Global March website pieces, August 2003; 2 x CLNS website newsletter pieces, Aug 2003.
- Copy of DRAFT employment bill 2004 (not yet official).
- Various newspaper articles produced over 1st project year.
- Year 2 activities:
 - Design of workshop model and plan to carry out training of local level government officials, district children’s advisory committees and NGOs: Third training report covering Narok, Meru North, Machakos, Kiambu, Muranga, and Teso districts, September 2003.
 - 30 district level workshops using model – see above.
 - Workshop targeting police, lawyers and judiciary, 5 December 2004: Workshop report and participant list.

4. Produced by the Society for the Protection of the Rights of the Child, Pakistan

- Annual narrative project implementation reports and quarterly financial reports sent to Anti-Slavery International.
- End of project country evaluation report.
- Year 1 activities:
 - Provincial level workshops for civil society, ILO/IPEC, Ministry of Labour, employers, trade unions and children, March 2003: Lahore: participant list + photos; Peshawar: workshop report, participant list; various newspaper clippings.
 - District level consultation, ten completed by July 2003s: Kasu 19 March 2003: participant list and photos; Sialkot 3 April 2003: participant list; Okara 17 April 2003: participant list and photos; Pakpattan 17 April 2003: participant list; Sahiwal 18 April 2003: participant list; Faisalabad 23 April 2003: participant list; Mianwali 26 June 2003: participant list and newspaper clippings (urdu). Workshop for media and media campaign, seven completed by February 2003: Meeting report for Lahore, 16 January 2003; SPARC/Media Foundation Consultation, 12 June 03: participant list and photos.
 - Documentary for use as resource for advocacy: Copy of video on the life of the girl child in Heera Mandi, the red light area of Lahore (2003).
 - Awareness-raising campaign aimed at public, “Child Labour Free Week,” November 2002: Photos; flyers; pocket calendar; various newspaper clippings.
- Year 2 activities:
 - Provincial level workshops for civil society, ILO/IPEC, Ministry of Labour, employers, trade unions and children, Karachi, 17 February 2004: participant list
 - District level consultations: Sialkot 12 October 2003: participant list and photos; Multan 1 December 2003: newspaper clippings; Hango 23 December 2003: report, participant list and newspaper clippings; Pakpattan 9 January 2004: participant list.
 - Awareness-raising campaign aimed at public, “Child Labour Free Week,” November 2003: 29 local and national newspaper clippings (english and urdu); Nowshera seminar participant list and newspaper clippings.
 - National Consultation on Child Domestic Workers, 6-7 September 2003: newspaper clippings.
 - Selections for World Congress: Peshawar 16 March 2004: participant list, newspaper clippings; Lahore 20 March 2004: participant list and photos; Hyderabad 27 March 2004: participant list, photos, newspaper clippings.

5. Produced by WAO-Afrique, Togo/Ghana

- Annual narrative project implementation reports and quarterly financial reports sent to Anti-Slavery International.
- End of project country evaluation report.
- Year 1 activities:
 - Translation of “Do you know ... about the new ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention?” (original, 2001) into Ewe (Togo): brochure in hard copy and pdf (available on Anti-Slavery International website: www.antislavery.org); Tsui (Ghana) translation in hard copy only.
 - Meeting with National Employers’ Council and other employers’ groups, 23-4 April 2003: meeting report including agenda, most presentations and participant list; video of meeting; photos of meeting; various newspaper clippings.
 - Joint awareness-raising campaign with Protestant, Catholic and Muslim bodies, 25-26 February 2003: campaign report; photos of campaign; various newspaper clippings.
 - Story adaptation and video production: Copy of video: “Journal d’une Bonne” (“Diary of a Domestic Servant”).
- Year 2 activities:
 - National Consultation with relevant ministries and civil society, Accra (Togo and Ghana), 13-15 October 2003: Meeting report and participant list.
 - Joint Awareness-raising campaign with religious groups: photos of campaign.
 - Meeting and training for police, lawyers and judiciary, social workers, labour inspectorate and trade unions, 11-12 March 2004: photos of meeting.

6. Produced by Anti-Slavery International

- Annual narrative project implementation reports and quarterly financial reports submitted to the Department for International Development.
- Final evaluation report (2004).
- Evaluation Sheet – Common framework for country evaluations (2004).
- Meeting with National Employers’ Council and other employers’ groups, 23-4 April 2003, organized by WAO-Afrique, Lomé, 23-24 April 2003: Presentations: “Le rôle des employeurs aux plans national et international dans l’élimination des pires formes de travail des enfants” and “Discours d’Ouverture.”
- Media training facilitated with ANPPCAN, 8-9 May 2003: Training module; training evaluation form; table of feedback from evaluation form.
- Training for labour officers and factory inspectors, 8 October 2003: Presentation: “The Role of Labour Inspectors in the Elimination of Child Labour”.
- Provincial level workshops for civil society, ILO/IPEC, Ministry of Labour, employers, trade unions and children, Karachi, 17 February 2004: Presentations: “Introductory Address,” “The key provisions of ILO Convention 182” and “the Role of Key Stakeholders in Eliminating Harmful Child Labour.”

Annex 3: Text of ILO Convention 182 and Recommendation 190 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour

1. C182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999

The General Conference of the International Labour Organization,

Having been convened at Geneva by the Governing Body of the International Labour Office, and having met in its 87th Session on 1 June 1999, and

Considering the need to adopt new instruments for the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, as the main priority for national and international action, including international cooperation and assistance, to complement the Convention and the Recommendation concerning Minimum Age for Admission to Employment, 1973, which remain fundamental instruments on child labour, and

Considering that the effective elimination of the worst forms of child labour requires immediate and comprehensive action, taking into account the importance of free basic education and the need to remove the children concerned from all such work and to provide for their rehabilitation and social integration while addressing the needs of their families, and

Recalling the resolution concerning the elimination of child labour adopted by the International Labour Conference at its 83rd Session in 1996, and

Recognizing that child labour is to a great extent caused by poverty and that the long-term solution lies in sustained economic growth leading to social progress, in particular poverty alleviation and universal education, and

Recalling the Convention on the Rights of the Child adopted by the United Nations General Assembly on 20 November 1989, and

Recalling the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and its Follow-up, adopted by the International Labour Conference at its 86th Session in 1998, and

Recalling that some of the worst forms of child labour are covered by other international instruments, in particular the Forced Labour Convention, 1930, and the United Nations Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade, and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery, 1956, and

Having decided upon the adoption of certain proposals with regard to child labour, which is the fourth item on the agenda of the session, and

Having determined that these proposals shall take the form of an international Convention;

adopts this seventeenth day of June of the year one thousand nine hundred and ninety-nine the following Convention, which may be cited as the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999.

Article 1

Each Member which ratifies this Convention shall take immediate and effective measures to secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour as a matter of urgency.

Article 2

For the purposes of this Convention, the term *child* shall apply to all persons under the age of 18.

Article 3

For the purposes of this Convention, the term *the worst forms of child labour* comprises:

- (a) all forms of slavery or practices similar to slavery, such as the sale and trafficking of children, debt bondage and serfdom and forced or compulsory labour, including forced or compulsory recruitment of children for use in armed conflict;
- (b) the use, procuring or offering of a child for prostitution, for the production of pornography or for pornographic performances;
- (c) the use, procuring or offering of a child for illicit activities, in particular for the production and trafficking of drugs as defined in the relevant international treaties;
- (d) work which, by its nature or the circumstances in which it is carried out, is likely to harm the health, safety or morals of children.

Article 4

1. The types of work referred to under Article 3(d) shall be determined by national laws or regulations or by the competent authority, after consultation with the organizations of employers and workers concerned, taking into consideration relevant international standards, in particular Paragraphs 3 and 4 of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation, 1999.
2. The competent authority, after consultation with the organizations of employers and workers concerned, shall identify where the types of work so determined exist.
3. The list of the types of work determined under paragraph 1 of this Article shall be periodically examined and revised as necessary, in consultation with the organizations of employers and workers concerned.

Article 5

Each Member shall, after consultation with employers' and workers' organizations, establish or designate appropriate mechanisms to monitor the implementation of the provisions giving effect to this Convention.

Article 6

1. Each Member shall design and implement programmes of action to eliminate as a priority the worst forms of child labour.
2. Such programmes of action shall be designed and implemented in consultation with relevant government institutions and employers' and workers' organizations, taking into consideration the views of other concerned groups as appropriate.

Article 7

1. Each Member shall take all necessary measures to ensure the effective implementation and enforcement of the provisions giving effect to this Convention including the provision and application of penal sanctions or, as appropriate, other sanctions.
2. Each Member shall, taking into account the importance of education in eliminating child labour, take effective and time-bound measures to:
 - (a) prevent the engagement of children in the worst forms of child labour;
 - (b) provide the necessary and appropriate direct assistance for the removal of children from the worst forms of child labour and for their rehabilitation and social integration;
 - (c) ensure access to free basic education, and, wherever possible and appropriate, vocational training, for all children removed from the worst forms of child labour;
 - (d) identify and reach out to children at special risk; and
 - (e) take account of the special situation of girls.
3. Each Member shall designate the competent authority responsible for the implementation of the provisions giving effect to this Convention.

Article 8

Members shall take appropriate steps to assist one another in giving effect to the provisions of this Convention through enhanced international cooperation and/or assistance including support for social and economic development, poverty eradication programmes and universal education.

Article 9

The formal ratifications of this Convention shall be communicated to the Director-General of the International Labour Office for registration.

Article 10

1. This Convention shall be binding only upon those Members of the International Labour Organization whose ratifications have been registered with the Director-General of the International Labour Office.

2. It shall come into force 12 months after the date on which the ratifications of two Members have been registered with the Director-General.

3. Thereafter, this Convention shall come into force for any Member 12 months after the date on which its ratification has been registered.

Article 11

1. A Member which has ratified this Convention may denounce it after the expiration of ten years from the date on which the Convention first comes into force, by an act communicated to the Director-General of the International Labour Office for registration. Such denunciation shall not take effect until one year after the date on which it is registered.

2. Each Member which has ratified this Convention and which does not, within the year following the expiration of the period of ten years mentioned in the preceding paragraph, exercise the right of denunciation provided for in this Article, will be bound for another period of ten years and, thereafter, may denounce this Convention at the expiration of each period of ten years under the terms provided for in this Article.

Article 12

1. The Director-General of the International Labour Office shall notify all Members of the International Labour Organization of the registration of all ratifications and acts of denunciation communicated by the Members of the Organization.

2. When notifying the Members of the Organization of the registration of the second ratification, the Director-General shall draw the attention of the Members of the Organization to the date upon which the Convention shall come into force.

Article 13

The Director-General of the International Labour Office shall communicate to the Secretary-General of the United Nations, for registration in accordance with article 102 of the Charter of the United Nations, full particulars of all ratifications and acts of denunciation registered by the Director-General in accordance with the provisions of the preceding Articles.

Article 14

At such times as it may consider necessary, the Governing Body of the International Labour Office shall present to the General Conference a report on the working of this Convention and shall examine the desirability of placing on the agenda of the Conference the question of its revision in whole or in part.

Article 15

1. Should the Conference adopt a new Convention revising this Convention in whole or in part, then, unless the new Convention otherwise provides --

(a) the ratification by a Member of the new revising Convention shall ipso jure involve the immediate denunciation of this Convention, notwithstanding the provisions of Article 11 above, if and when the new revising Convention shall have come into force;

(b) as from the date when the new revising Convention comes into force, this Convention shall cease to be open to ratification by the Members.

2. This Convention shall in any case remain in force in its actual form and content for those Members which have ratified it but have not ratified the revising Convention.

Article 16

The English and French versions of the text of this Convention are equally authoritative.

2. R190 Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation, 1999

The General Conference of the International Labour Organization,

Having been convened at Geneva by the Governing Body of the International Labour Office, and having met in its Eighty-seventh Session on 1 June 1999, and

Having adopted the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999, and

Having decided upon the adoption of certain proposals with regard to child labour, which is the fourth item on the agenda of the session, and

Having determined that these proposals shall take the form of a Recommendation supplementing the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999;

adopts this seventeenth day of June of the year one thousand nine hundred and ninety-nine the following Recommendation, which may be cited as the Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation, 1999.

1. The provisions of this Recommendation supplement those of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (hereafter referred to as "the Convention"), and should be applied in conjunction with them.

I. Programmes of action

2. The programmes of action referred to in Article 6 of the Convention should be designed and implemented as a matter of urgency, in consultation with relevant government institutions and employers' and workers' organizations, taking into consideration the views of the children directly affected by the worst forms of child labour, their families and, as appropriate, other concerned groups committed to the aims of the Convention and this Recommendation. Such programmes should aim at, inter alia:

(a) identifying and denouncing the worst forms of child labour;

(b) preventing the engagement of children in or removing them from the worst forms of child labour, protecting them from reprisals and providing for their rehabilitation and social integration through measures which address their educational, physical and psychological needs;

(c) giving special attention to:

(i) younger children;

(ii) the girl child;

(iii) the problem of hidden work situations, in which girls are at special risk;

(iv) other groups of children with special vulnerabilities or needs;

(d) identifying, reaching out to and working with communities where children are at special risk;

(e) informing, sensitizing and mobilizing public opinion and concerned groups, including children and their families.

II. Hazardous work

3. In determining the types of work referred to under Article 3(d) of the Convention, and in identifying where they exist, consideration should be given, inter alia, to:

(a) work which exposes children to physical, psychological or sexual abuse;

(b) work underground, under water, at dangerous heights or in confined spaces;

(c) work with dangerous machinery, equipment and tools, or which involves the manual handling or transport of heavy loads;

(d) work in an unhealthy environment which may, for example, expose children to hazardous substances, agents or processes, or to temperatures, noise levels, or vibrations damaging to their health;

(e) work under particularly difficult conditions such as work for long hours or during the night or work where the child is unreasonably confined to the premises of the employer.

4. For the types of work referred to under Article 3(d) of the Convention and Paragraph 3 above, national laws or regulations or the competent authority could, after consultation with the workers' and employers' organizations concerned, authorize employment or work as from the age of 16 on condition that the health, safety and morals of the children concerned are fully protected, and that the children have received adequate specific instruction or vocational training in the relevant branch of activity.

III. Implementation

5. (1) Detailed information and statistical data on the nature and extent of child labour should be compiled and kept up to date to serve as a basis for determining priorities for national action for the abolition of child labour, in particular for the prohibition and elimination of its worst forms as a matter of urgency.

(2) As far as possible, such information and statistical data should include data disaggregated by sex, age group, occupation, branch of economic activity, status in employment, school attendance and geographical location. The importance of an effective system of birth registration, including the issuing of birth certificates, should be taken into account.

(3) Relevant data concerning violations of national provisions for the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour should be compiled and kept up to date.

6. The compilation and processing of the information and data referred to in Paragraph 5 above should be carried out with due regard for the right to privacy.

7. The information compiled under Paragraph 5 above should be communicated to the International Labour Office on a regular basis.

8. Members should establish or designate appropriate national mechanisms to monitor the implementation of national provisions for the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, after consultation with employers' and workers' organizations.

9. Members should ensure that the competent authorities which have responsibilities for implementing national provisions for the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour cooperate with each other and coordinate their activities.

10. National laws or regulations or the competent authority should determine the persons to be held responsible in the event of non-compliance with national provisions for the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour.

11. Members should, in so far as it is compatible with national law, cooperate with international efforts aimed at the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour as a matter of urgency by:

(a) gathering and exchanging information concerning criminal offences, including those involving international networks;

(b) detecting and prosecuting those involved in the sale and trafficking of children, or in the use, procuring or offering of children for illicit activities, for prostitution, for the production of pornography or for pornographic performances;

(c) registering perpetrators of such offences.

12. Members should provide that the following worst forms of child labour are criminal offences:

(a) all forms of slavery or practices similar to slavery, such as the sale and trafficking of children, debt bondage and serfdom and forced or compulsory labour, including forced or compulsory recruitment of children for use in armed conflict;

(b) the use, procuring or offering of a child for prostitution, for the production of pornography or for pornographic performances; and

(c) the use, procuring or offering of a child for illicit activities, in particular for the production and trafficking of drugs as defined in the relevant international treaties, or for activities which involve the unlawful carrying or use of firearms or other weapons.

13. Members should ensure that penalties including, where appropriate, criminal penalties are applied for violations of the national provisions for the prohibition and elimination of any type of work referred to in Article 3(d) of the Convention.

14. Members should also provide as a matter of urgency for other criminal, civil or administrative remedies, where appropriate, to ensure the effective enforcement of national provisions for the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, such as special supervision of enterprises which have used the worst forms of child labour, and, in cases of persistent violation, consideration of temporary or permanent revoking of permits to operate.

15. Other measures aimed at the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour might include the following:

- (a) informing, sensitizing and mobilizing the general public, including national and local political leaders, parliamentarians and the judiciary;
- (b) involving and training employers' and workers' organizations and civic organizations;
- (c) providing appropriate training for the government officials concerned, especially inspectors and law enforcement officials, and for other relevant professionals;
- (d) providing for the prosecution in their own country of the Member's nationals who commit offences under its national provisions for the prohibition and immediate elimination of the worst forms of child labour even when these offences are committed in another country;
- (e) simplifying legal and administrative procedures and ensuring that they are appropriate and prompt;
- (f) encouraging the development of policies by undertakings to promote the aims of the Convention;
- (g) monitoring and giving publicity to best practices on the elimination of child labour;
- (h) giving publicity to legal or other provisions on child labour in the different languages or dialects;
- (i) establishing special complaints procedures and making provisions to protect from discrimination and reprisals those who legitimately expose violations of the provisions of the Convention, as well as establishing helplines or points of contact and ombudspersons;
- (j) adopting appropriate measures to improve the educational infrastructure and the training of teachers to meet the needs of boys and girls;
- (k) as far as possible, taking into account in national programmes of action:
 - (i) the need for job creation and vocational training for the parents and adults in the families of children working in the conditions covered by the Convention; and
 - (ii) the need for sensitizing parents to the problem of children working in such conditions.

16. Enhanced international cooperation and/or assistance among Members for the prohibition and effective elimination of the worst forms of child labour should complement national efforts and may, as appropriate, be developed and implemented in consultation with employers' and workers' organizations. Such international cooperation and/or assistance should include:

- (a) mobilizing resources for national or international programmes;
- (b) mutual legal assistance;
- (c) technical assistance including the exchange of information;

(d) support for social and economic development, poverty eradication programmes and universal education.